



REAL ESTATE

1427-1431 Greenfield Ave. DRB-SPP Findings

THE REQUESTS

The Applicant, Greenfield Ohio, LLC is seeking the following discretionary approvals from the City of Los Angeles:

Pursuant to L.A.M.C. Section 11.5.7-C, a Project Permit Compliance and per **L.A.M.C. Section 16.50, a Design Review** approving demolition of two two-story multi family buildings, one including five units and the other two, on two lots and the construction of a new six-story, 29-unit, apartment building located within the Westwood Community Specific Plan.

Pursuant to L.A.M.C Section 12.22-A,31, the **Director** shall review a Transit Oriented Communities Affordable Housing Incentive Program project application in accordance with the procedures outlined in LAMC Section 12.22-A,25(g). The project is located within a Transit Oriented Community - Tier 3 (TOC) area and will be pursuing additional incentives in accordance with these sections.

Pursuant to various sections of Los Angeles Municipal Code, the Applicant will request approvals and permits from the Building and Safety Department and other municipal agencies as required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Project Site

The subject property consists of two regularly shaped flat lots containing a combined area of 13,506 square feet with a 100-foot frontage along Greenfield Avenue. The property is currently occupied by two two-story multifamily buildings, one including five units and the other two, and associated garages constructed in 1935 and 1940.

The subject site is located in the Westwood Community Plan in an area designated for *Medium Residential* land uses and is zoned [Q]R3-1-O. The property is also located within the Westwood Community Design Review Board and Multiple family Residential Development Standards Specific Plan as well as the West Los Angeles Transportation Improvement and Mitigation Specific Plan. The project is also located within a Transit Oriented Communities - Tier 3 (TOC) area and is eligible for additional incentives.

The surrounding properties are all zoned [Q]R3-1-O and primarily occupied by multifamily residential uses. Two properties to the southeast are occupied by single family residences.

Proposed Project

This request is part of a Proposed Project to demolish the existing two two-story multifamily buildings and garages, one including five units and the other two for a total of seven units, and to construct a new six-story, 29-unit apartment building with two levels of subterranean parking, a roof deck and a total max height of 66 feet.

The project will be pursuing TOC incentives including base incentives to allow for greater density, higher FAR and reduced parking relative to the LAMC and Westwood Community Specific Plan. In addition, the project is pursuing additional TOC incentives including a reduction in open space requirements and an increase in allowable height. Also, the project will be pursuing a Westwood Specific Plan Project Permit Compliance and Westwood Design Review board approval.

LAMC Conformance

As stated above, the Applicant is requesting specific plan approval and design review for demolition of two existing multifamily buildings and construction of one new 29 unit apartment building pursuant to **L.A.M.C. Section 11.5.7-C** and **Section 16.50**. The Proposed Project is an Eligible Housing Development and will be pursuing base and additional incentives as allowed for by the Transit Oriented Communities (TOC) Affordable Housing Incentive Program Guidelines, enumerated in section 12.22.A.31 of the Los Angeles Municipal Code (LAMC). Where the TOC Guidelines differ from the base LAMC and the Specific Plan, the TOC requirements will supersede.

STREETS AND CIRCULATION

Greenfield Avenue- Adjoining the property to the northeast is a Greenfield Avenue. Designated as a Local Street Standard, Greenfield Avenue is dedicated to a width of 60 feet and improved with a roadway of 36 feet. No additional dedication or improvement is required or proposed as part of this project.

PREVIOUS ZONING RELATED ACTIONS

None

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION / FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL OF PROJECT PERMIT COMPLIANCE

Pursuant to L.A.M.C. Section 11.5.7-C

- 1. The project substantially complies with the applicable regulations, findings, standards, and provisions of the Westwood Community Design Review Board and Multiple family Residential Development Standards Specific Plans**

The Proposed Project construction of a 29-unit apartment building in an area designated for such land use. No changes in use is proposed as part of the project. The Proposed Project will utilize the base and additional incentives allowed for by TOC Guidelines but will otherwise comply with the pertinent Specific Plans as outlined below.

Westwood Community Multi-Family Specific Plan

Section 5 Land Use Regulations

A. Building Height

Regulations do not apply as the property does not abut an R1 or more restrictive zone.

B. Parking Standards

The Proposed Project includes the provision of 47 parking spaces across two levels of subterranean parking. In addition, three short term and 30 long term bike parking spaces will be included on the site. Per the Specific Plan, parking rates are dictated by the number of habitable rooms at rates varying from 2.25 to 3.25 spaces per unit resulting in a requirement of 70 parking spaces. However, as an Eligible Housing Development, the Proposed Project is able to utilize a reduce parking ratio per TOC base incentives of .5 spaces per unit resulting in a total of 15 required parking spaces.

While the Specific Plan parking requirements are superseded by the TOC Guidelines, the proposed parking strikes a balance between the two, providing for a level of parking appropriate for the projects proximity to transit and necessary for the economically viable development of a project including affordable units.

Section 6 Design Standards

A. Open Space

Open space will be provided throughout the project including hardscaping and landscaping within all yards, an open courtyard through the center of the building and 1,897 square feet of landscaped open space in a rooftop garden

on the 6th floor. Total proposed open space is 4,354 square feet. Over half of the first floor open space will be landscaped, approximately 1,423 square feet.

Per the Specific Plan, open space is required at a rate of 200 square feet per unit resulting in a requirement of 5,800 square feet of open space. The Specific Plan further delineates that, 50% of the open space must be landscaped; 25% of open space is allowed above the ground floor as long as it is stepped back 10 feet from level below and 40% is landscaped; only 50% of the front and rear yard can count towards open space, as long as they are landscaped.

However, as an Eligible Housing Development, the Proposed Project is able to utilize reduction of 25% in required open space per TOC additional incentives resulting in a total requirement of 4,350 square feet of open space.

Additionally, the Proposed Project is able to utilize an additional Open Space reduction of 25% with regard to the Specific Plan requirements for distribution of Open Space between the Ground Floor and all other Floors. Per the Specific Plan, 75% of the total required Open Space must be located on the Ground Floor. As a result of TOC additional incentives, only 56.25% of the total required Open Space must be located on the Ground Floor (75% reduced by 25% = 56.25%).

While the Specific Plan open space requirements are superseded by the TOC Guidelines, a total of 2,457 square feet will be provided on the first floor and 1,897 square feet will be provided on the 6th floor. This will result in compliance with the specific plan to the extent feasible by the proposed project and again, in a way necessary for the economically viable development of a project including affordable units.

B. Walkways

Regulations do not apply as the property is not more than 150 feet wide.

C. Building Setbacks

Regulations do not apply as the property does not abut an R1 or more restrictive zone

D. Garage

Two levels of subterranean parking are proposed. Only access to the parking will be above grade, thus the proposed project will comply with the Specific Plan.

E. Yard Requirements

As noted previously, the project does not abut an R1 zone and therefore is only required to provide the standard setbacks for the zone, 15 feet front and rear and 9 foot side yards. While the TOC Guidelines allow for a 30% reduction in two yards, the Proposed Project does not include such a reduction. Consequently, the project conforms to the Specific Plan.

F. Buffer

Regulations do not apply as the property does not abut an R1 or more restrictive zone

G. Screening

An underground vault will be provided to house the utilities for the proposed project, limiting the roof top equipment proposed. All remaining rooftop equipment will be screened from view of adjacent properties by a 2 foot 8 inch parapet wall

Section 7 Landscape Standards

Proposed landscaping includes a 869 sf of planters in the front yard, 750 sf in the rear yard, and 989 sf in the side yard. In addition four new trees will be planted in the parkway along Greenfield Avenue replacing one existing street tree. The proposed street trees will be reviewed by the Street Tree Division of the Bureau of Street Maintenance. Four trees total are required and proposed along the frontage to meet the required minimum ratio of one for every 30 lineal feet of street frontage abutting the project. The four new trees will be planted at a box size that meets the minimum maturity requirements of the Specific Plan.

Section 8 Design Review

The proposed project will be reviewed by the Westwood Community Design Review Board (DRB) to evaluate the conformance with the criteria listed below

Westwood Community DRB Section 6.B

1. *Whether all proposed structures conform to all of the provisions contained within the Westwood Community Plan and any applicable specific plans or design guidelines.*

As enumerated above, the proposed project will comply with a large proportion of the design guidelines established by the Westwood Multifamily Specific Plan.

2. *Whether all proposed structures are designed so as not to cast shadows on one-third or more of any adjacent residential structure as projected on a plan view for more than two hours between the hours of 9 a.m. and 3 p.m. on December 21.*

Based on shade/shadow analysis completed for the proposed project, the structure will cast a shadow on the property to the northwest for more than two hours. The additional height that causes this shading is integral to achieving the density necessary to provide the proposed affordable housing. That said, the Proposed Project will be set back from the adjacent property 9 feet so as not to create a crowding effect and block access to light and air. Furthermore, the adjacent property is eligible for the same TOC base incentives which would allow a development of comparable height, thus making the shadowing effect impermanent.

3. *Whether all proposed buildings are designed in such a fashion so that all ventilation, heating or air conditioning ducts, tubs, equipment, or other related appurtenances are adequately screened from public view, unless such appurtenances have been used as an integral component in the design.*

An underground vault will be provided to house the utilities for the proposed project, limiting the roof top equipment proposed. All remaining rooftop equipment will be screened from view of adjacent properties by a 2-foot 8 inch parapet wall.

4. *Whether the proposed buildings are compatible with the surrounding buildings in terms of design, massing, and architectural integrity.*

The surrounding community includes primarily multi family buildings/ condominiums ranging significantly in number of units from duplexes to 100+ unit apartment buildings. Surrounding properties directly abutting the project site range in height, area and density as enumerated in the table below.

ADDRESS	LOCATION	HEIGHT	AREA	UNITS
1421 S Greenfield Avenue	northwest	4 stories (height unknown)	8,453 (assessor)	5 apartments
1416-1420 S Camden AVenue	northwest	3 stories (height unknown)	17,289 (assessor)	16 apartments
1426-1434 S Camden Avenue & 11017-11021 W Ohio Avenue	southwest	4 stories (height unknown)	unknown	18 unit Condo complex
11011 Ohio Avenue	southeast	2 stories-27 feet	914 (assessor)	1 SFD
11009 W Ohio Avenue	southeast	2 stories (height unknown)	1,904 (assessor)	1 duplex
1437 Greenfield Avenue	South	2 stories (height unknown)	1,274 (assessor)	1 SFD

While the massing of the proposed project is larger than properties directly abutting, this is a necessary feature of the project to allow for the density of affordable units. That said, the project will abide by the required setbacks for the neighborhood and will include landscaping and open space to help mitigate the impact of proposed massing. The design of the project is a contemporary aesthetic and will be compatible with apartment buildings in the surrounding neighborhood which were largely built in the 1980's and share a similar contemporary aesthetic.

5. *Whether any portion of a parking garage visible above grade is architecturally integrated with the design of the building.*

Parking for the proposed project will be located in two levels of a subterranean private parking garage accessed via an automatic gate form a driveway off of Greenfield Avenue. The garage door is the only visible portion of the garage above grade. The garage door will be setback from the primary façade of the structure and is architecturally compatible with the primary structure.

6. *Whether the landscape design has a variety of plant materials throughout the project which are compatible and representation of the plant materials accurately reflects their growth habit at maturity.*

Proposed landscaping includes a variety of plant types and sizes, primarily with low water requirements, that will be compatible with the neighborhood and the region. The landscaping plan takes into consideration both the landscaping size at planting and at full maturity.

7. *Whether the proposed development is in conformity with the Los Angeles Municipal Code and other applicable laws insofar as zoning and land use are involved.*

The proposed project is the construction of a 29-unit apartment building on a lot designated for such use within the general plan and the specific plan which identify it as *Medium Residential* land use zoned [Q]R3-1-O and therefore complies with the LAMC in regards to zoning and land use.

TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCENTIVE PROGRAM /AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCENTIVES COMPLIANCE FINDINGS

Pursuant to Section 12.22-A,31(e) of the LAMC, the Director shall review a Transit Oriented Communities Affordable Housing Incentive Program project application in accordance with the procedures outlined in LAMC Section 12.22-A,25(g).

- 1. The incentives are not required to provide for affordable housing costs as defined in California Health and Safety Code Section 50052.5 or Section 50053 for rents for the affordable units.**

The record does not contain substantial evidence that would allow the Director to make a finding that the requested incentives are not necessary to provide for affordable housing costs per State Law. The California Health & Safety Code Sections 50052.5 and 50053 define formulas for calculating affordable housing costs for very low, low, moderate, and extreme income households. Section 50052.5 addresses owner occupied housing and Section 50053 addresses rental households. Affordable housing costs are a calculation of residential rent or ownership pricing not to exceed 25 percent gross income based on area median income thresholds dependent on affordability levels.

The list of base incentives in the Transit Oriented Communities Guidelines were pre-evaluated at the time the Transit Oriented Communities Affordable Housing Incentive Program Ordinance was adopted to include types of relief that minimize restrictions on the size of the project. The on-menu incentives are required to provide for affordable housing costs because the incentives by their nature may increase the scale of the project. The additional incentives requested for a height increase and open space reductions, would result in building design or construction efficiencies that provide for affordable housing costs. As a result of the prescribed incentives, it is likely that the Director will always conclude that the incentives are required for such projects to provide for affordable housing units as identified by the TOC Guidelines.

The requested incentives, a 22-foot increase in the building height, an approximate 25 percent reduction in the required open space, and a 25% reduction in the required Open Space on the Ground Floor, are expressed in the Menu of Incentives per the TOC Guidelines, and as such, permit exceptions to zoning requirements that result in building design or construction efficiencies that provide for affordable housing costs. The requested incentives allow the developer to expand the building envelope so the additional units can be constructed, and the overall space dedicated to residential uses is increased. These incentives support the Applicant's decision to set aside two (2) Extremely Low Income dwelling units, two (2) Very Low Income dwelling units, and one (1) Low Income dwelling unit for 55 years.

Height. The requested increase in height is expressed in the Menu of Incentives in the Transit Oriented Communities Guidelines which permit exceptions to zoning requirements that result in building design or construction efficiencies that provide for affordable housing costs. The [Q]R3-1-O zone allows a building height of 45 feet. The TOC height incentive allows for an additional 22 feet in height and two additional stories thereby creating a building envelope with the area necessary to accommodate the

proposed density, including the affordable housing units. The project is 67 feet in height and six stories with two levels of subterranean parking. The requested incentives in combination with the requested floor area of 36,239 square feet (not including the 21,111 sf of subterranean garage area) will allow the developer to increase the amount of units in the building so that five (5) units reserved for extremely low, very low, and low income households can be constructed and the overall space dedicated to residential uses is increased. This incentive supports the Applicant's decision to set aside two (2) Extremely Low Income dwelling units, two (2) Very Low Income dwelling units, and one (1) Low Income dwelling unit for 55 years.

Open Space. The requested open space incentive, allowing a 25 percent reduction of the total open space requirement and a 25% reduction in the required open space on the ground floor, are expressed in the Menu of Incentives in the Transit Oriented Communities Guidelines which permit exceptions to zoning requirements that result in building design or construction efficiencies that facilitate affordable housing costs. Per the Westwood Specific Plan, the proposed project is required to provide a minimum of 5,800 square feet of open space, however, the project will be utilizing the open space incentive to reduce the minimum open space requirement to 4,350 square feet. Additionally, per the Specific Plan, 75% of the total required Open Space must be located on the Ground Floor. As a result of TOC additional incentives, only 56.25% of the total required Open Space must be located on the Ground Floor (75% reduced by 25% = 56.25%). These reductions in open space requirements allow the inclusion of affordable housing while still providing usable open space as intended by the code and Specific Plan. The requested incentive allows the developer to reduce open space requirements so that that five (5) units reserved for extremely low, very low, and low income households can be constructed and the overall space dedicated to residential uses is increased. This incentive supports the Applicant's decision to set aside two (2) Extremely Low Income dwelling units, two (2) Very Low Income dwelling units, and one (1) Low Income dwelling unit for 55 years.

- 2. The Incentive will have a specific adverse impact upon public health and safety or the physical environment, or on any real property that is listed in the California Register of Historical Resources and for which there are no feasible method to satisfactorily mitigate or avoid the specific adverse Impact without rendering the development unaffordable to Very Low, Low and Moderate Income households. Inconsistency with the zoning ordinance or the general plan land use designation shall not constitute a specific, adverse impact upon the public health or safety.**

There is no evidence that the proposed incentive will have a specific adverse impact. A "specific adverse impact" is defined as "a significant, quantifiable, direct and unavoidable impact, based on objective, identified written public health or safety standards, policies, or conditions as they existed on the date the application was deemed complete" (LAMC Section 12.22 A.25(b)). The proposed Project and potential impacts were analyzed in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines and the City's L.A. CEQA Thresholds Guide. These two documents establish guidelines and thresholds of significant impact and provide the data for determining whether or not the

impacts of a proposed Project reach or exceed those thresholds. Analysis of the proposed Project determined that it is Categorically Exempt from environmental review pursuant to Article 19, Class 32 CEQA Guidelines.

Therefore, there is no substantial evidence that the proposed Project will have a specific adverse impact on the physical environment, on public health and safety, or on property listed in the California Register of Historic Resources.